

The **International Organization of Targumic Studies** had two Business Meetings at its Fourth Congress in Leiden on 29-30 July 2004. The main topic of the meetings was the proposal of the Targum Edition Exploratory Committee.

IOTS Business Meeting #1, 29 July 2004

1. President Paul Flesher (PF) convened the meeting at 5:45 pm.
2. Alberdina Houtman (AH), Chair of the Targum Edition Exploratory Committee (TEEC), gave a summary presentation of the proposal to establish an International Targum Text Edition Project (ITTEP) developed by the TEEC. Printed copies of the proposal (version 3.6) had previously been distributed to all IOTS members present. (Version 3.6 will shortly be available for viewing on the IOTS website.)
3. AH reported the vote of the TEEC recommending that the IOTS adopt the proposal as 5 in favor and 1 against. PF reported the vote of the IOTS Executive Committee as 7 in favor and 2 against. Steven Kaufman (SK) asked whether his views (on the TEEC) had been reported correctly. (SK had initially voted in favor, but then agreed with the dissenting vote but had not formally changed his own vote.) A discussion then ensued indicating that most of the TEEC and Executive Committee members were concerned about two key issues, whichever way they had voted. These were the questions of: (1) Are there enough people interested in the project to participate in the positions and tasks envisioned by the proposal? (2) Will sufficient funds be available to enable the project to move forward? Since neither committee could answer these questions, it was now up to the IOTS to decide whether to move forward with the project and how to accomplish it.
4. Discussion then moved to the question of whether the proposed project should move forward. Several people spoke to the success of other large-scale editing projects which did not necessarily look successful at the outset but which ultimately succeeded. Martin McNamara (MM) described two projects with which he has been involved and Luis Díez Merino (LDM) discussed Sperber's difficulties in getting his targum edition published. The point of all these remarks was that the IOTS should vote to enable the project to move ahead, despite an initial lack of funding, and to do so with the ultimate expectation of success.
5. The question of personnel was also discussed. David Shepherd (DS) asked whether there were enough people to do the work. AH responded that the administrative structure was not as cumbersome as it might seem on the surface. The Governing Board of the proposed ITTEP largely consists of the section leaders (i.e., they serve two functions) with a few supporting roles. LDM also argued that we can build on textual work already accomplished. Edward Cook (EC) pointed out that the Palestinian Targums and some of the Writings Targums would not need much work because they did not have many manuscripts. He also cautioned that the work needed sufficient personnel to be done well, for once done, it would not be re-approached for many decades. Roger Syrén (RS) observed that this was by necessity a long-term project, but that it was a necessary one and needed to be started. AH pointed out that there were a number of people already working on textual matters with the targums to the Prophets and with Targum Onkelos. There

certainly were sufficient people to move ahead in those areas. PF pointed out that for the Palestinian Targum area good transcriptions of the manuscripts (usually one manuscript per text) already existed, so that there would be comparatively little to do with them.

6. Coming back to DS's original question, then, the Writings Targums were discussed. Apart from DS himself, who works on the Job Targum, no other scholars working on Writings Targums were present. PF mentioned the work of Moshe Bernstein on Psalms and Christian Brady's work on Lamentations. PF indicated that he might be interested in working on Ruth, if Derek Beattie could not be enticed. And of course, other scholars have worked on Writings Targums, including LDM, Taradach, Stec, and so on. (See the list in the proposal's appendix.) Since so few were present, it was recognized that this area would need input that could not presently be obtained.
7. SK brought up a question about the priority of the proposal's two central goals: Goal One being the creation of an edited text, and Goal Two being the creation of a manuscript database for textual and other work. (See the proposal itself for a fuller description.) SK argued that the database should be the first goal not the second. Indeed, the goal of an edited text was decidedly secondary. PF responded that the question had been discussed in the TEEC and that he himself had argued that the edition idea was a better selling pitch to possible funding agencies. SK responded that that had been the case when CAL had gotten started, but it was no longer. Willem Smelik (WS) agreed that in Europe matters had also changed to make databases more acceptable. Indeed, perhaps in the end an edited text would not be an important goal of the ITTEP. A discussion then ensued between SK, WS, EC, LDM, and PF about whether the priority of the goals should be reversed. In the end, all agreed that goal two was the most important.
8. Finally a discussion was held about how to move forward. AH suggested that the proposal be approved in principle and that the sections be organized, but the decision on the putting into place the entire overarching structure be postponed. LDM, MM, JWW, and DS agreed with this notion, positing that the proposal be approved, a few positions on the Governing Board be filled, scholars sought out to work on different books, and other organizational steps be taken by the appointees. A report of the success of these steps would be given at the next IOTS congress in 2007 and a decision about whether and/or how to move forward would be taken by the IOTS then.
9. Concerns were then raised about the character of the database, etc. Eveline van Staalduine-Sulman (EVSS) indicated that she was working on a pilot project using the Targum to Samuel in which she was addressing many of these questions. A brief discussion ensued which agreed that EVSS should also report on her pilot project in 2007 to help the IOTS members decide how to develop the ITTEP project.
10. EC then put forward a motion: **The IOTS should accept the feasibility and desirability of the ITTEP project proposed by the TEEC. We authorize that the project move forward guided by the submitted proposal (version 3.6) with the understanding that initial members of the Governing Board be selected at**

this Congress and report to the IOTS Congress in 2007. SK seconded the motion.

11. SK proposed an amendment. **Goal Two of the proposal is recognized to be primary and Goal One is secondary in importance and urgency.** DS seconded. The amendment was approved by acclamation.
12. There being no other amendments, Cook's motion as amended by SK's motion was put to the vote. It was approved by acclamation. It was then announced that the matter of personnel would be addressed at the next business meeting the following day. President Flesher adjourned the meeting at 7:30 pm.

IOTS Business Meeting #2, 30 July 2004

1. President Paul Flesher (PF) convened the meeting at 3:30 pm.
2. PF put forward a slate of people who agreed to serve in ITTEP Governing Board positions and help organize the project for the three years until the 2007 congress. These people would begin organizing the project, revise the ITTEP proposal as voted the previous day, undertake a pilot project (EVSS), and do what was necessary to set it up. The Governing Board and/or its Director would have the power to co-opt further people as needed.

Organizing Director: Paul Flesher

Targum Jonathan section co-heads: Harry Sysling and Jan-Wim Wesselius

Targum Onkelos section: Willem Smelik will take steps to organize a committee that will elect a section head.

Targum Writings section: The director take steps to organize a committee that will elect a section head.

Palestinian Targum: The director take steps to organize a committee that will elect a section head.

At-large members of the ITTEP Governing Board:

Luis Díez Merino

Stephen Kaufman

Rimon Kasher

Eveline van Staalduine-Sulman

Advisor to the Board: M. McNamara

3. A vote was taken and the slate of candidates was elected by acclamation.

Election of IOTS Officers and Board

4. Nominations were taken for IOTS President. Two nominations were made and declined. Paul V.M. Flesher was nominated, he accepted and was elected by acclamation.
5. Nominations were taken for IOTS Vice-President. Willem Smelik was nominated for a second term. Having previously indicated his acceptance, he was elected via acclamation.

6. Two persons were nominated for IOTS Secretary/Treasurer, Christian Brady and Eveline van Staaldune-Sulman. Both accepted. A vote was taken and EVSS was elected.
7. The following persons were nominated and elected to the IOTS Executive Committee:
 - Robert Hayward
 - Roger Syrén
 - Josep Ribera Florit
 - Moshe Bernstein
 - Rimon Kasher
 - David Shepherd
8. The meeting was adjourned at 3:45 p.m.